Fad Diets

Simon Newsom, PGY-3

Thomas Jefferson University

Follow this and additional works at: https://jdc.jefferson.edu/fmlectures

Part of the Family Medicine Commons, and the Primary Care Commons

Let us know how access to this document benefits you

Recommended Citation
https://jdc.jefferson.edu/fmlectures/443

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Jefferson Digital Commons. The Jefferson Digital Commons is a service of Thomas Jefferson University's Center for Teaching and Learning (CTL). The Commons is a showcase for Jefferson books and journals, peer-reviewed scholarly publications, unique historical collections from the University archives, and teaching tools. The Jefferson Digital Commons allows researchers and interested readers anywhere in the world to learn about and keep up to date with Jefferson scholarship. This article has been accepted for inclusion in Department of Family & Community Medicine Presentations and Grand Rounds by an authorized administrator of the Jefferson Digital Commons. For more information, please contact: JeffersonDigitalCommons@jefferson.edu.
Fad Diets

Behavioral Health Lecture Series
Simon Newsom - PGY3
I intermittently intermittent fast
Overview

- Brief history of dieting
- Overview of different types of fad diets
- Conditions affected by specific dieting
- Physicians role in dieting
Case 1

SM is a 48 yo female, BMI 34, who is presenting for her annual physical. She has no acute complaints, but mentions she is trying to lose weight and is wondering what your thoughts are on that “new cool diet” out there, (unfortunately she cant remember the name), and is wondering if you can give her more information on the diets available.
At any given point, ~45% of women and 30% of men in the US are trying to lose weight.

Despite this, the prevalence of obesity has doubled in the past 20 years.

**CDC:**
- 72% of Americans are overweight
- 40% are obese

Diet is the leading cause of death and disability in the USA.
50% Of Americans diet annually
Fad Diets

A trendy weight-loss plan that promises rapid, dramatic results

Tell you what you can and cannot eat

Generally do not encourage a change in lifestyle

Typically, these diets are not healthy and don't result in long-term weight loss.
History of Dieting

“Four Humours”
1550 BC - Ebers Papyrus
500 BC Warrior Diet
19th century Victorian England - sip and spit, sugar free diet
1830’s Sylvester Graham - whole grain diet
Arsenic diet pills, Tapeworm diet

1925 Cigarette Diet
1930’s Hollywood Grapefruit diet
1950’s Cabbage soup diet
1960-70’s Weight Watchers, Sleeping beauty diet, Slim Fast
1990’s Atkins Diet
21st Century: Ketogenic, IF, Paleo, gluten free
Red Flags /How to Spot a Fad Diet

- Promise weight loss >2 lb per week
- Highly restrictive or nutritionally unbalanced (no carb, liquid diet only)
- Encourage Superfoods that can “burn fat” or detoxify
- Promise “One size fits all” or silver bullet
- No discussion of exercise
- Based largely on anecdotal stories
- Focus on appearance vs overall health
Most Common Diets
Caloric Restriction

Weight Watchers - “Step by small step”

Foods are assigned a point value, based on calories, fat, and fiber content

Allotted daily points, can spend as you like (no foods are off limits!)

Weekly meetings or group meetings and weekly weigh-ins are part of the process

Goal of ~2 lb/ week weight loss
Weight Watchers

Points = (Calories * .0305) + (Sat Fat * .275) + (Sugar * .12) - (Protein * .098)
Weight Watchers

Variable cost and services

- Interactive app
- 24/7 chat services
- Fitness tracker, recipes, rewards for healthy behavior
- Workshops (in persona and virtual)
- Personal coach

Free to choose food yourself
Weight Watchers

Has been shown to consistently demonstrate greater efficacy at reducing weight at 12 months compared to placebo.

Overweight participants assigned to WW were 9x more likely to lose 10% of their weight than participants who used publically accessible websites only.
Weight Watchers

Regularly viewed as the top fad diet of the past half century

1. Easy to follow/ flexible
2. Lots of support
3. No excluded food groups
4. Constantly evolving
Case 2

DO is a 24 year old M w/ hx of epilepsy. BMI 33. He comes in for consultation for weight loss. He asks if there are any diets that may help with his seizures, as he read in a magazine on an airplane that certain diets can improve epilepsy in certain patients. What would you recommend?
Low Carb Diets/ Low Glycemic Index

- Examples: Atkin’s, The Zone, Ketogenic Diet
- Atkins Diet
  - High protein/ fat, low carb (<35g/ day)
  - More than 10 million copies have been sold
  - No longer the diet of unlimited bacon and eggs
Table 2. Sample daily menus based on authors’ diet book instructions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Atkins-Induction</th>
<th>Atkins-Maintenance</th>
<th>Ornish</th>
<th>USDA Food Guide Pyramid</th>
<th>The Zone</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Breakfast</strong></td>
<td><strong>Omelet</strong></td>
<td><strong>Omelet</strong></td>
<td><strong>1 cup cooked plain oatmeal</strong></td>
<td><strong>Yogurt Parfait</strong></td>
<td><strong>Omelet</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 large eggs</td>
<td>3 large eggs</td>
<td>1/2 cup cottage cheese</td>
<td>1 apple cut up</td>
<td>1/2 medium banana</td>
<td>2/3 cup Egg Beaters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 oz cheddar cheese</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1 tsp cinnamon</td>
<td>1/4 cup low-fat granola</td>
<td>1 oz reduced-fat cheese</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 tbsp butter</td>
<td>1/2 cup avocados</td>
<td>1 cup cantaloupe</td>
<td>2 tsp preserves</td>
<td>1 slice whole wheat bread</td>
<td>1/2 tsp natural peanut</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 tsp salsa</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1 tsp skim milk</td>
<td>1 tsp natural peanut</td>
<td>peanut butter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 oz Canadian bacon</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1 slice whole wheat bread</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| **Lunch**             | **Grilled Chicken Salad** | **Tuna Salad** | **Chicken-Dill Wrap** | **Tuna Pocket** | **Tuna Pocket** |
| 6 oz grilled boneless chicken breast w/ skin | 2 cups romaine lettuce | 2 cups romaine lettuce | 2 cups romaine lettuce | 2 cups romaine lettuce | 2 cups romaine lettuce |
| 1/4 cup slivered almonds | 1/2 cup red cabbage | 1 medium tomato | 1/4 cup chicken breast | 1/2 tsp light mayonnaise | 2/3 whole wheat pita Salad |
| 1 tbsp olive oil      | 1 tsp vinegar     | 1/2 tsp lemon juice | 1 tsp dill weed | 1/2 tsp light mayonnaise | 3/4 tsp olive oil |
| 1 tsp vinegar         |                    | 2 tbsp nonfat plain yogurt | 1 tsp tortilla | 2 cups romaine lettuce | 1/2 tsp light mayonnaise |

| **Snack**             | **8 oz roasted turkey** | **6 oz roast turkey** | **1 baked potato** | **4 oz baked boneless, skinless chicken breast** | **3 oz baked boneless, skinless chicken breast** |
| 1/2 cup broccoli      | 1/4 cup green beans | 1/4 cup onion sautéed in | 3/4 cup cooked broccoli | 1 cup cooked brown rice | 1/2 cup cooked pasta |
| 1 tsp butter           | 1/4 cup slivered almonds | 1/4 cup corn kernels | 3/4 cup greyed broccoli | 1/4 cup broccoli | 2 1/2 cups broccoli |

<p>| <strong>Dinner</strong>            | <strong>3 cups air popped popcorn</strong> | <strong>1 peach</strong> | <strong>1/3 cup 1% cottage cheese</strong> |
| 8 oz grilled tuna steak | 1/2 cup broccoli | 1/2 cup carrots | 1/2 cup lowfat plain yogurt | 1/2 cup lowfat plain yogurt | 1/2 cup lowfat plain yogurt |
| 1/2 cup broccoli      | 1/4 cup green beans | 1/4 cup corn kernels | 3 cups air popped popcorn | 1 peach | 1/3 cup 1% cottage cheese |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Food</th>
<th>Grams of Carbs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Slice of whole wheat bread</td>
<td>18g</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slice of white bread</td>
<td>15g</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 banana</td>
<td>27g</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cup of rice</td>
<td>45g</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 potato</td>
<td>37g</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 bag of potato chips</td>
<td>120g</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Component</td>
<td>Low-Carbohydrate Diet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Caloric or energy restriction</td>
<td>Not needed; ketosis may help to reduce caloric intake</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food choices</td>
<td>Very restricted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Initial rate of weight loss</td>
<td>Fast, with increased diuresis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weight loss</td>
<td>Dependent on duration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weight maintenance</td>
<td>Unproven over the long term</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compliance or dropout rate</td>
<td>Compliance is low and dropout rate between 33%-50% short term</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LDL (&quot;bad&quot;) cholesterol</td>
<td>No change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HDL (&quot;good&quot;)</td>
<td>Greater increase</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Triglycerides</td>
<td>Greater reduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unique benefit</td>
<td>Treatment for drug-resistant epilepsy (increases brain acetone); acts as anticonvulsant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Potential long-term concerns</td>
<td>Calciuria (renal stones and reduced bone mass); high protein content (patients with renal/liver disease); atherogenicity (high saturated fat, trans fat, and cholesterol levels and relative absence of fruits, vegetables, and whole grains)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
High protein/ Low Carb Diet

Associated with short term improvement in weight, HDL, TG, BP

Encourage high intake of saturated fat → may accelerate atherosclerosis long term

Increased risk of bone density loss and renal stones due to increased acid
Figure 1. High-Protein, Low-Carbohydrate (HPLC) Diet and Atherosclerosis. A recent study by Poo et al. suggests that an HPLC diet promotes atherosclerosis through mechanisms that do not modify the classic cardiovascular risk factors. They studied mice that were fed standard laboratory chow (Panel A), a so-called Western diet (Panel B), or an HPLC diet (Panel C). They found that mice that were fed the HPLC diet had almost twice the level of arterial plaque as mice that were fed a Western diet. The classic risk factors did not differentiate these two groups of mice, even though both were fed atherogenic diets. Normally, endothelial progenitor cells are released from the bone marrow and home to an damaged endothelium to promote repair and maintain normal vascular reactivity. The mice that were fed the HPLC diet had markedly lower circulating endothelial progenitor cells and higher levels of nonesterified fatty acids than mice that were fed the Western diet. LDL denotes low-density lipoprotein.
Ketogenic Diet

Approximately 55%-60% fat, 30%- 35% protein and 5% -10% carbohydrates (<50g per day of total carbs)

Well documented short term effects on weight, few studies looking at sustained weight loss

Keto flu?

Contraindicated in CKD, insulin sensitive diabetics need to be cautious
Ketogenic Diet

1. In the absence of circulating sugar from food, insulin levels drop
2. Induces gluconeogenesis and glycogenolysis to meet the cellular demand
3. No additional dietary glucose taken in
4. This leads to state of catabolism (breakdown) to meet the body’s demands, and the body will break down fat stores into ketone bodies (ketosis)
5. Breakdown of fat stores ultimately leads to weight loss
6. This shift usually takes 2-4 days of consuming <50g of carbohydrates daily
Obesity

Common to see rapid initial weight (~10lb in two weeks) loss due to diuretic effect

LCHF diets produced greater weight loss for initial six months, but no significant difference one year out

Known association with decreased sugary food intake and improvement of metabolic syndrome and DM
Diabetes

HFLC diets have been shown to help control blood glucose due to less glucose ingestion and improved insulin sensitivity.

Must be care in patients on insulin or at risk of hypoglycemia.
Ketosis has long been shown to have a positive effect on patients suffering from epilepsy, and has been part of treatment for decades.

Ketosis increases brain acetone levels, which act as an anticonvulsant.

May also affect GABA levels and limit ROS, boosting energy production in brain tissue.
Case 3

TR is a 42M with IDDM (on lispro TID with meals), who recently relocated from Silicon Valley and is presenting for a well check. He reports that his friends back home have all lost weight and gained energy after they started intermittent fasting. He asks you if it is safe for him to try this diet. How would you counsel this patient?
Caloric Restriction
Intermittent Fasting

Most popular diet in 2018

Starvation based diet

Restrict only *when* you eat, not what you eat

American Heart Association claims it may lower insulin resistance, cardiac disease, inflammation and encourage weight loss
THE 16/8 METHOD

Fasting Plans

ALTERNATE-DAY FASTING

EAT-STOP-EAT

THE WARRIOR DIET

Fasting Plans
Adaptive Mechanism/ Metabolic Switch

1) Fed state
   a) Dietary glucose is energy source
   b) Fat storage

2) Post absorptive State
   a) Glucagon secreted
   b) Glycogenolysis

3) Fasted State -- Metabolic Switch’’
   a) Glycogen depleted
   b) Fat hydrolysis
Weight loss

Typical weight loss 7-11 lbs over 10 week period

Few studies looking at long term sustainable weight loss

Most studies have shown no significant difference between fasting and daily caloric restriction one year out
Intermittent Fasting

1. Increased growth hormone
2. Reduce inflammation
3. Improved insulin sensitivity
4. Cellular regeneration
5. Preserved lean muscle mass
6. Extended lifespan
7. Improved sleep quality
8. Improvement in chronic pain and mood disorder

These benefits are proposed to be due to stimulation of evolutionary adaptive response

- increased expression of antioxidants
- DNA repair
- protein quality control
- mitochondrial biogenesis and autophagy
- down-regulation of inflammation
Physical and Cognitive Conditioning

Young men who IF have been shown to lose more fat while maintaining more lean muscle

Mice maintained on alternate-day fasting have better running endurance than mice that have unlimited access to food.

IF enhances cognition in multiple domains, including spatial memory, associative memory, and working memory
Aging

Goodrick et al

The average lifespan of rats is increased by up to 80% when they are maintained on a regimen of alternate-day feeding

Coleman et al 2009

20 year study that showed that caloric restriction slowed aging in rhesus monkeys
Risks

Must be careful in patients who are insulin dependent diabetics, especially mealtime insulin, although this may ultimately increase insulin sensitivity.

Other considerations: on meds requiring food for coadministration, pregnant or breastfeeding women, dementia.
Case 4

PN is a 58 yo M with hx of HTN on amlodipine, chlorthalidone and lisinopril. He presents for annual physical and is hoping to learn more about dietary modifications that can help with his blood pressure. In addition to lifestyle modifications, he is interested in a specific diet to help lower his BP. What would you recommend?
DASH Diet

“Dietary Approaches to Stop Hypertension”

Recommended for people with HTN or at risk of heart disease

Focuses on fruits, vegetables, whole grains and lean meats

Goal of limiting salt intake (<2300mg daily) to decrease BP
Paleo

Based on diet of paleolithic man

Goal: eliminate many of the processed sugars and foods that eat more whole plant and animal foods

Restrictive - cannot eat dairy, processed foods, grains, legumes

May help to lower visceral fat
Paleo

Weight loss due to:

1. Increased protein intake
2. Elimination of processed carbs/ added sugar (few empty calories)
3. Whole foods emphasized (increased non starch fiber)
So which is best?

2009 Sacks et. al. showed that reduced-calorie diets result in clinically meaningful weight loss regardless of which macronutrients they emphasized. There is no “best diet” and each should be taken in the overall context of the individual patient.

Comparison of Weight-Loss Diets with Different Compositions of Fat, Protein, and Carbohydrates

Case 5

CD is 35F presenting for follow up of her many chronic conditions. She is a new patient to your office and reports that she has struggled with her weight for years, and has been hesitant to make an appointment because her previous doctor “always seemed like he was disappointed in me and judged me for my weight”. She reports she has gained the “COVID 19” and is eager to lose weight again.
Stigma

Primary care providers hold both explicit and implicit biases about people with obesity

- Less rapport building
- More dominant language
- Lower expectations regarding compliance
- Less time spent educating patients
- Over-attribute symptoms to obesity
- Less likely to refer to specialists
Our Role as Physicians

Physician acknowledgement of patients weight has been shown to increase patient desire to lose weight, and report clinically significant weight loss.

Patients were more likely to lose 5-10% of body weight if their physicians told them they were overweight.

Patients who reported support from PCP lost twice as many lbs as those who didn't.
Our Role as Physicians

We have the potential to improve our patients' dietary habits by providing basic evidence-based nutritional advice.

Focus should be on good *balanced* nutrition and healthy eating behaviors.

Recognize at risk patients and refer to specialists when appropriate.
Bottom Line

1. Fad diets are not going away
2. Most can help people lose weight rapidly, although few are sustainable long term
3. It is our role as physicians to encourage healthy lifestyle changes to create long term, sustainable improvement in health outcomes


